Patterns of genetic differentiation in *Thamnophis* and *Taricha* from the Pacific Northwest

Benjamin J. Ridenhour¹, Edmund D. Brodie Jr² and Edmund D. Brodie III³

**ABSTRACT**

**Aim** The co-evolutionary interaction between the common garter snake, *Thamnophis sirtalis*, and the rough-skinned newt, *Taricha granulosa*, takes place throughout much of the Pacific Northwest (North America). The biogeography of the Pacific Northwest has been heavily influenced by the last Pleistocene glaciation, which reached a maximum as late as 14,000 yr BP. We researched: (1) what type of population structure is present for garter snakes and newts, (2) whether the population structure of these species is consistent with a Pleistocene glaciation hypothesis, and (3) how population structure and migration possibly affect co-evolution between these species.

**Location** The Pacific Northwest of North America, specifically northern California, Oregon and Washington in the USA.

**Methods** We sampled approximately 20 populations for each species from three different transects. Using microsatellite markers and tissue samples from both species, we quantified the population structure for both species. Individual-based assignment tests were used to estimate contemporary migration rates.

**Results** Both *Th. sirtalis* and *Ta. granulosa* exhibited little genetic differentiation among our study sites, even among those separated by large distances. Significant population structure was detected on multiple geographic scales. Differences in population structure were observed among transects and between garter snake and newt transects. Contemporary migration rate estimates indicate high levels of genetic exchange between populations.

**Main conclusions** Prior to this study, little was known about the fine-scale population structure of either species in this region. Patterns of population structure for garter snakes and newts reflect a shared biogeographical history affected by the Pleistocene glaciation in the Pacific Northwest. Both species apparently migrate frequently between populations, thus potentially retarding the process of adaptive co-evolution. We find that populations from a northern coastal transect (Washington) are most likely to be locally adapted.

**Keywords** Biogeography, co-evolution, garter snake, gene flow, North America, phylogeography, Pleistocene glaciation, population structure, *Taricha granulosa*, *Thamnophis sirtalis*.

**INTRODUCTION**

Genetic subdivision among populations plays a central role in the geographic mosaic theory of co-evolution (Thompson, 1994, 1999a,b; Burdon & Thrall, 1999; Nuismer et al., 1999; Gomulkiewicz et al., 2000). Co-evolution is a process that occurs across a complex geographic landscape, and co-evolutionary interactions are not equivalent across the
range of an interaction. Genetic subdivision allows populations to follow separate evolutionary paths so that populations across a species’ range may exhibit a diversity of phenotypic values. Populations in which reciprocal selection is strong act as sources of adaptive change for traits at the phenotypic interface of co-evolution (Brodie & Ridenhour, 2003). Depending upon the rate of gene exchange between populations, maladaptation may occur in populations intermediate to the hot and cold spots (Nuismer et al., 1999; Gomulkiewicz et al., 2000). In particular, Gomulkiewicz et al. (2000) showed that asymmetries in gene flow in two interacting species can increase the chance of maladaptation at a stable equilibrium. The term maladaptation will be used herein in the sense that a population is not at its fitness optimum (i.e. not local adaptation sensu Kawecki & Ebert, 2004).

The theoretical predictions related to the geographic mosaic remain largely untested in natural populations. Relatively few empirical studies have examined genetic subdivision within co-evolutionary systems (some recent examples include Dybdahl & Lively, 1996; Alhoff & Thompson, 2001; Mutikainen & Koskela, 2002; Leebens-Mack & Pellmyr, 2004; Sullivan & Faeth, 2004). In a host–parasite study of the stinging nettle, Urtica dioica and the greater dodder, Cuscuta europaea (Mutikainen & Koskela, 2002), selection was found to be strong enough to prevent maladaptation within the system. Similarly, Dybdahl & Lively (1996) found high levels of gene flow in a freshwater snail, but found evidence of strong local adaptation of the snail to its tetradotoxin parasite. In contrast, Sullivan & Faeth (2004) found the opposite scenario – asymmetric population structuring in the endophytic fungus Neotyphodium and its host grass Festuca arizonica led to maladaptation. While no formal quantification of gene flow was made in the wild parsnip Pastinaca sativa–parsnip webworm Depressaria pastinacella system, physical transfer of individuals by 30 m from their source population significantly increased mortality, leading to the conclusion that gene flow is most probably maladaptive in this interaction (Zangerl & Berenbaum, 2003). Further empirical studies of gene flow in co-evolutionary systems are needed in order to gain an understanding of the causes of local (mal)adaptation.

The effect of migration on adaptive dynamics in co-evolutionary interactions depends heavily on the genetic control of traits at the co-evolutionary phenotypic interface. Some theoretical work has demonstrated that increased migration can be adaptive in major-gene co-evolution (Gandon et al., 1996; Gandon & Michalakis, 2002). Increased genetic variance arising from migration and resulting in a quicker response to selection explains this result. The important factor is actually gene flow relative to the interacting species’ gene flow (Gandon & Michalakis, 2002). Empirical evidence for this phenomenon exists in the anther-smut fungus Microbotryum violaceum and its host plant Silene latifolia (Kaltz et al., 1999), and to a lesser degree in a Pseudomonas fluorescens bacterium–bacteriophage system (Morgan et al., 2005). However, the role of gene flow as a facilitator of adaptation relies on genes-of-major-effect underlying the traits that mediate ecological interactions. In other cases, where traits are polygenic and interactions lead to escalating co-evolutionary dynamics, migration among populations is predicted to lead to local maladaptation (Ridenhour & Nuismer, in press).

The interaction between the common garter snake and the rough-skinned newt is mediated by polygenic traits and exhibits the selection mosaic pattern predicted by the geographic mosaic theory of co-evolution (Thompson, 1994; Brodie et al., 2002). Taricha granulosa uses the potent neurotoxin tetrodotoxin (TTX) as a chemical defence that results in the death of most would-be predators (Brodie, 1968). Thamnophis sirtalis has evolved resistance to the effects of TTX, thus allowing this snake to exploit newts as prey items (Brodie & Brodie, 1990, 1991). Garter snake resistance levels are spatially variable and point towards the presence of at least two hot spots: one in central Oregon and one in the San Francisco Bay area (Brodie et al., 2002). Taricha granulosa toxicity levels have been less extensively studied but are spatially variable as well, and also point to at least one hot spot in central Oregon (Hanifin et al., 1999).

Little is known about the population structure of Ta. granulosa and Th. sirtalis in the Pacific Northwest. A large-scale phylogeography of Ta. granulosa indicates that rough-skinned newts in California are more divergent than and distantly related to newts in Washington and Oregon (Kuchta & Tan, 2005). Work on other taxa lends some insight into the genetic subdivision of newts. Twitty et al. (1964) showed that the red-bellied newt, Ta. rivularis, of northern coastal California demonstrates a high degree of breeding-site fidelity using mark–recapture studies: a large fraction of the newts displaced several kilometres and across river drainages would return to their original breeding site within a year. From a transect no greater than 26 km in length and using allozymes, Hedgecock (1978) reported a Fst value of 0.062 for Ta. rivularis, suggesting a surprisingly high degree of population subdivision for such a short distance. This result is somewhat unexpected, given that: (1) the deme size of Ta. rivularis was estimated to be upwards of 10,000 (Hedgecock, 1978), (2) the longevity of newts is unknown, but marked newts of 17–18 years of age were recaptured by Twitty, (3) females lay large numbers of eggs, and (4) newts are capable of long-distance overland migration (Twitty et al., 1964). A more recent study on Ta. granulosa using microsatellites estimated Fst = 0.005 for two populations separated by 16 km in central Oregon (Jones et al., 2001); this value is approximately 12 times lower than that reported by Hedgecock (1978). The large difference in Fst between these two studies may in part arise from the use of allozymes vs. microsatellites.

Knowledge of the population structure of Th. sirtalis in the Pacific Northwest is scant as well. A phylogeography of Th. sirtalis in the Pacific Northwest revealed three distinct clades (Janzen et al., 2002). These lineages were similar to those observed in Ta. granulosa: a California clade, a northwest coastal clade, and an intermountain clade. No fine-scale studies have been performed in the Pacific Northwest, but
studies of Lake Erie garter snakes found that there is no isolation by distance between populations of *Th. sirtalis* (King & Lawson, 2001; Bittner & King, 2003). In contrast, water snakes (*Nerodia sipedon*) and brown snakes (*Storeria dekayi*) from the same area show a negative relationship between gene flow and distance (King & Lawson, 2001). Populations of *Th. sirtalis* that are 100 km apart show approximately the same number of migrants as those just a few kilometres distant (Bittner & King, 2003). Gregory & Stewart (1975) measured movements of 4.3–17.7 km between feeding grounds and hibernation areas in Manitoba. The lack of isolation by distance and the observed long-distance migration suggest that *Th. sirtalis* is capable of long-distance dispersal and may have little genetic subdivision.

The biogeography of the Pacific Northwest of North America has been heavily influenced by Pleistocene glaciation. A glacial maximum was reached between 17,000 and 14,000 yr BP (Thackray et al., 2004); glaciers had receded from the region by c. 11,500 yr BP (Doerner & Carrara, 1999). Studies of plants, mammals, insects, fish, and crustaceans (Conroy & Cook, 2000; Althoff & Thompson, 2001; Arbogast et al., 2001; Edmands, 2001; Ettl & Peterson, 2001; Ritland et al., 2001; Smith et al., 2001; Small et al., 2003) have all found patterns consistent with recolonization during the glacial recession and periodic flooding that occurred. Low levels of genetic variation often found in the Pacific Northwest are attributed to range expansion after the glacial recession (Brown et al., 1997; Althoff & Thompson, 2001; Edmands, 2001). Studies of some amphibians (the Del Norte salamander, *Plethodon elongatus* and the spotted frog, *Rana pretiosa*) revealed population structure congruent with glacial recolonization (Green et al., 1996; Mahoney, 2004). There is a paucity of biogeographical studies of snake species in the Pacific Northwest, although a study on the population structure of the rubber boa, *Charina bottae*, from the California Floristic Province demonstrates that climatic fluctuation events shape population structure for snake species as well (Calsbeek et al., 2003).

We sampled *Th. sirtalis* and *Ta. granulosa* in a broad area in the Pacific Northwest in order to assess the fine-scale population genetics of these two co-evolving species. We estimated genetic differentiation, population structure, and gene flow using microsatellite loci in order to improve understanding of the biogeographical history of these species and their co-evolutionary past and future. Furthermore, such estimates give us insight into the potential for local adaptation within this predator–prey system.

**METHODS**

We collected *Th. sirtalis* and *Ta. granulosa* from 19 and 22 populations, respectively, from northern California, Oregon, and Washington (Fig. 1). We targeted collection sites to be c. 32 km apart (see Supplementary Material Tables S1.1 and S1.3 for separation distances, and Table S1.5 for site locations). Sample localities that have the same name (e.g. Hunter Creek) may be several kilometres apart for snakes and newts (Supplementary Material Table S1.5). Selecting short inter-population distances reduces the effect of history on population structure and leads to better estimates of contemporary gene flow (Slatkin, 1993). We calculated the linear distance between populations based upon latitude and longitude coordinates.

We collected samples from three transects – referred to as the ‘northern coast’, the ‘southern coast’, and ‘inland’ (Fig. 1) – which have variable terrain types that could be described, respectively, as: along a river drainage, across multiple river drainages, and mountainous. The inland transect begins at the crest of the Cascade mountains, ends at the Pacific coast at the Tenmile Creek population, and follows the North Santiam and Alsea river drainages. The southern coast transect begins at the Tenmile Creek population on the central Oregon coast, follows the coast southwards until reaching Orick, CA, and crosses multiple river drainages. The northern coast transect begins just south of the mouth of the Columbia River at Warrenton, OR, proceeds due north until reaching the Strait of San Juan, and goes through the mountainous western third of Washington.

These three transects were picked for two reasons. First, the three transects varied greatly in garter snake phenotypic differences between the endpoints (Brodie et al., 2002). At one end of each transect, garter snake resistance to TTX was high, while at the other end resistance was low. If genetic divergence parallels phenotypic divergence, these transects should provide good opportunity to observe population structure in *Th. sirtalis* and *Ta. granulosa*. This provides us with the greatest inference into the co-evolutionary process. Second, we wished to have some level of replication at the transect level. By taking several transects across different terrain types, we hope that, on average, our study will provide better insight into the comparative population structure and gene flow of *Th. sirtalis* and *Ta. granulosa*.

**Sample collection and genotyping**

We collected garter snakes and newts from mid-May to the beginning of July from each population. We attempted to capture 20 individuals per population. Tail clips from both species were stored in individually labelled microcentrifuge tubes containing 90% ethanol. The number of individuals genotyped in each population ranged from 3 to 24 (Table 1). We isolated whole genomic DNA using Qiagen DNeasy 96 Tissue kits. Isolated DNA concentrations measured using a Molecular Devices SpectraMAX 190 microplate spectrophotometer were diluted using ddH2O to a standard concentration for use in polymerase chain reactions (PCR). Diluted DNA was frozen and stored at −20°C.

We genotyped individuals using four microsatellite loci for both *Th. sirtalis* and *Ta. granulosa* (see Supplementary Material Appendix S1 for PCR conditions). For *Th. sirtalis*, microsatellite loci Ns1, Ns1, and Ns10 described in Prosser et al. (1999) and locus Ts1 of McCracken et al. (1999) were used for analysis. For *T. granulosa*, microsatellite loci Tgr01, Tgr04,
Tgr10, and Tgr14 described in Jones et al. (2001) were used. Several other loci were screened for both species; the utilized microsatellites were chosen because of their high levels of polymorphism and reliable amplification across all samples. We visualized PCR products using an Applied Biosystems 3730 DNA analyser (a high-throughput capillary sequencer). We scored genotypes using Applied Biosystems GeneMapper software.

**Statistical analyses**

We measured genetic differentiation using the parameter θ (Weir & Cockerham, 1984) (denoted as θnst in this paper to distinguish it from other θ parameters used in evolutionary genetics). Because microsatellites fit stepwise mutation models, estimates of θnst may be low and underestimate the degree of population structure (Gaggiotti et al., 1999). Slatkin (1995) developed Rnst – another measure of population structure – to account for the effect of a stepwise mutation process. We calculated Rnst using the method of Rousset (1996) at the whole-population level for comparison with θnst values. Sometimes Rnst may be misleading owing to potentially higher variance in estimates (Balloux & Goudet, 2002); we therefore used θnst for all subsequent analyses.

We used FSTAT (Goudet, 2001) to estimate θnst for three different levels: across the entire sampling region, across individual transects, and pairwise between all sample populations. For all pairwise population comparisons of genetic differentiation, the hypothesis H1: θnst ≠ 0 was tested; significance was determined by ΦSTAT using randomization of individuals (not alleles) among populations (n = 5060). For pairwise comparisons across the entire set of populations, significance levels were corrected using the Bonferroni method; the Dunn-Šidák method was used for correcting significance levels when questions involved the significance within a transect (Sokal & Rohlf, 1995).

**Figure 1** Locations of sample populations in the Pacific Northwest. The dashed line indicates the approximate southern extent of the last glacial maximum. The shaded region indicates the area of glaciation in the Oregon Cascades (Wright & Frey, 1965). The horizontal bars indicate the portion of the Klamath-Siskiyou Mountains where glaciation occurred at higher altitudes. The transect designation for the populations is on the right; Tenmile Creek was included in both the inland and southern coast transects.
regression of $\theta_a'$ on the natural logarithm of distance

\[ \theta_a' = \theta_a/(1-\theta_a); \]

Rousset, 1997] to estimate the mean amount of migration between populations for each species (neighbourhood size, $4D\pi\sigma^2$; where $D$ is the population density and $\sigma^2$ is the dispersal distance variance).

Non-equilibrium conditions and historical events confound estimates of gene flow. To disentangle contemporary gene flow from these factors, we used Bayesian assignment tests to estimate contemporary migration rates ($m$) (BayesAss 1.3, Wilson & Rannala, 2003). Ongoing gene flow relates more directly to the question of adaptation than do historical events; contemporary gene flow acts to balance selective pressures in separate populations while historical events do not (i.e. historical event effects are only visible in neutral genetic variation). This analysis was carried out for $9 \times 10^6$ generations with the first third of the samples discarded as a ‘burn-in’. The iterative changes in allele frequencies ($p$), inbreeding value ($F$), and migration rate ($m$) were adjusted so that roughly 40–60% of all changes in these parameters were accepted. Initially, five replicates were run for each species. After the first five replicates, it was apparent that some neighbouring populations behaved non-independently. Accordingly, these populations were combined and three more replicates were run.

**RESULTS**

All loci showed a great diversity of alleles (13 alleles minimum); Th. sirtalis loci tended to be slightly more diverse than those used for Ta. granulosa analysis. Allele counts for garter snakes were 27, 13, 34, and 20 for locus Ts1, Ns12, Ns13, and Ns10, respectively. Allele counts in newts were 15, 13, 18, and 30 for locus Tgr1, Tgr04, Tgr10, and Tgr14, respectively. Hardy-Weinberg expectations were met in nearly all populations sampled; newt populations from Orick, Hoquiam, and Threemile Creek exhibited a heterozygote deficiency owing to Tgr04, suggesting that there might be a null allele at this locus in these populations. All eight microsatellite loci amplified very reliably; of the 717 individuals genotyped, only 38 individuals failed to amplify at one locus, and only one individual failed at two loci. While a power analysis would be complicated given the number of pairwise comparisons performed (every comparison would require its own analysis), in many cases we detected significant $\theta_a$ values as small as 0.01 (Tables S1.2 and S1.4).

Genetic subdivision estimates are low for Th. sirtalis and Ta. granulosa in the study range ($\theta_a = 0.036, 0.031$, respectively). The assumption of a stepwise mutation model made little difference in the measured population structure for both garter snakes and newts ($R_a = 0.041, 0.066$ respectively). $\theta_a$ values did not differ significantly between transects for either species (Th. sirtalis $\theta_a$: 0.032, 0.017, 0.028; Ta. granulosa $\theta_a$: 0.009, 0.025, 0.014; values given are for the inland, northern coast, and southern coast transects, respectively). Pairwise values of $\theta_a$ were low in general, regardless of the geographic distance separating the populations or the transect of origin (Tables S1.1–S1.4).

---

**Table 1 Population abbreviations and sample sizes**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Locale name</th>
<th>Two-letter abbreviation</th>
<th>Newts sampled</th>
<th>Snakes sampled</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clallam Bay</td>
<td>Cl</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoh River</td>
<td>HR</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cook Creek</td>
<td>Co</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoquiam</td>
<td>Ho</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potter Slough</td>
<td>Po</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinook</td>
<td>Ch</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warrenton</td>
<td>Wa</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lost Lake</td>
<td>Lo</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hwy 22 Ponds</td>
<td>Hw</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mill City</td>
<td>Mi</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stayton</td>
<td>St</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adair</td>
<td>Ad</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncle George</td>
<td>Un</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alsea</td>
<td>Al</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenmile Creek</td>
<td>Te</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tahkenit Creek</td>
<td>Ta</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morgan Creek</td>
<td>Mo</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edson Creek</td>
<td>Ed</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elk River</td>
<td>El</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Euchre Creek</td>
<td>Eu</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunter Creek</td>
<td>Hu</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chetco River</td>
<td>Ch</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crescent City</td>
<td>Cr</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orick</td>
<td>Or</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Latitude and longitude for each population are given in Table S5.*
Transects were significantly genetically differentiated from one another for both garter snakes and newts (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.015 \) and 0.021, respectively; \( P < 0.001 \) for both). Furthermore, AMOVA detected significant among-group variance for almost all transects. For the northern coast, significant subdivision was detected between populations north of Potter Slough and those populations south of and including Potter Slough in Th. sirtalis (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.014, P = 0.013 \)). Newt population structure showed a similar pattern in this region, but population subdivision was found between populations north of Hoquiam and those populations south of and including Hoquiam (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.029, P = 0.023 \)). For the southern coast, garter snakes were significantly subdivided, with a distinct group consisting of the southern populations of Crescent City and Orick (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.008, P = 0.024 \)). Taricha granulosa was again similar in structure, but with the distinct southern group consisting only of the Orick population (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.037, P = 0.002 \)). There was no significant among-group variance for Th. sirtalis populations along the inland transect. In contrast, Ta. granulosa populations exhibit significant structure between populations lying to the east of Adair and those populations west of and including Adair (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.010, P = 0.001 \)).

The scale at which IBD first occurred differed for garter snakes and newts. IBD in Th. sirtalis was detected at the 400-km level (\( \chi^2 = 6.86, \text{d.f.} = 2, P = 0.0324 \)), while in Ta. granulosa IBD was detected at the 200-km scale (\( \chi^2 = 6.75, \text{d.f.} = 2, P = 0.0342 \)). The effect of IBD was greater in newts (\( \beta = -0.5302 \pm 0.1554 \)) than in garter snakes (\( \beta = -0.2823 \pm 0.0964 \)).

The average pairwise \( \theta_a \) values for Th. sirtalis were 0.0452, 0.0088, and 0.0344 for the inland, southern coast, and northern coast transects, respectively. The average pairwise \( \theta_a \) for the southern coast was significantly smaller than that for the other two transects (bootstrapped t-tests with 1.0 \( \times 10^6 \) samples: \( P < 0.001 \) for both), and the difference between the inland and northern transects was marginally significant (\( P = 0.07 \)). The average pairwise \( \theta_a \) values for Ta. granulosa were 0.0097, 0.0226, and 0.0096 for the inland, southern coast, and northern coast transects, respectively. The average pairwise \( \theta_a \) value for the southern coast transect was significantly larger than the inland and northern coast values (\( P < 0.001, P = 0.005 \), respectively). In comparison, for garter snakes our estimate for the southern coast was significantly smaller than the inland and northern coast transect estimates.

Indirect estimates of gene flow based on population structure were higher in garter snakes than in newts. Analysis showed that neighbourhood size (4\( Dm \sigma^2 \)) for garter snakes was 65.4 individuals (\( \beta = 0.0153, P = 0.0001, R^2 = 0.0938, n = 153 \)), while newt neighbourhood size was 47.5 individuals (\( \beta = 0.0210, P < 0.0001, R^2 = 0.3442, n = 253 \)). Neighbourhood size is the number of breeding individuals falling within the potential range (characterized by the dispersal standard deviation, \( \sigma \)) of a breeding adult. The neighbourhood size estimates for both Th. sirtalis and for Ta. granulosa are relatively small compared with most estimates (see Waser & Elliott, 1991; Peterson, 1996; Rousett, 2000; Antolin et al., 2001; Giokas & Mylonas, 2004).

Contemporary immigration rate estimates indicate that migration between populations is strong (Table 2). Several populations acted non-independently in the sample. For the

### Table 2 Estimates of contemporary gene flow using BayesAss for (a) Taricha granulosa and (b) Thamnophis sirtalis*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Transect</th>
<th>( m )</th>
<th>Migrant source</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( a )</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.5 (0.009)</td>
<td>HR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.5 (0.009)</td>
<td>Cl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.282</td>
<td>CI/HR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ho</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.294</td>
<td>CI/HR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Po</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.281</td>
<td>CI/HR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ch</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.269</td>
<td>CI/HR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wa</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.306</td>
<td>CI/HR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lo</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>0.055</td>
<td>Te (CI/HR)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mi</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>0.296</td>
<td>Lo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>0.266</td>
<td>Lo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>0.280</td>
<td>Lo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Te</td>
<td>LS</td>
<td>0.294</td>
<td>Lo, Or</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ta</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.246</td>
<td>Hu (Lo)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.177</td>
<td>Cc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eu</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.302</td>
<td>El (Po)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hu</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.140</td>
<td>Cc (CI/HR)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cc</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.216</td>
<td>El</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Or</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.030</td>
<td>Hu (Ad)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( b )</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cl</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.308</td>
<td>Co</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.261</td>
<td>Ch/Po</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.017</td>
<td>Ch/Po</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ho</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.308</td>
<td>Co</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Po</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.5 (0.020)</td>
<td>Po</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ch</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.5 (0.020)</td>
<td>Po</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wa</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>0.305</td>
<td>Ch/Po</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lo</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>0.023</td>
<td>Mi (Ch/Po)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mi</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>0.273</td>
<td>Lo (Hu/El)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>0.299</td>
<td>Lo (Hu/El)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ad</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>0.295</td>
<td>Lo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Te</td>
<td>LS</td>
<td>0.266</td>
<td>Lo, Hu/El (Co)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ta</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.298</td>
<td>Hu/El</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.5 (0.092)</td>
<td>Hu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eu</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.248</td>
<td>Hu/El</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hu</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.5 (0.092)</td>
<td>El</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cr</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.289</td>
<td>Or</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Or</td>
<td>S</td>
<td>0.062</td>
<td>Hu/El (Ch/Po)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Migration rates (\( m \)) for Taricha granulosa (a) and Thamnophis sirtalis (b) were high for most populations (population abbreviations are listed in Table 1; for the transect column, I denotes inland, N denotes northern coast, and S denotes southern coast). Parenthetical values of \( m \) show migration rates after merging the original populations into one (e.g. Cl and HR became Cl/HR for newts). The ‘migrant source’ column shows the population on the same transect from which most immigrants originated; parenthetical values are given if a study population from a different transect composed a majority of the immigrants.
overestimate genetic homogeneity (Gaggiotti et al., 1999). The largest \( \theta_{st} \) values for pairwise comparisons of 0.1628 (garter snakes) and 0.1357 (newts) represent relatively little genetic differentiation when considering the distance separating the populations (368.1 and 783.3 km, respectively).

Despite the lack of genetic differentiation within this region for garter snakes and newts, significant population structure was detected using hierarchical F-statistics. For both species there was significant structure among the three study transects \( (F_{CT} = 0.015, 0.020 \text{ for garter snakes and newts, respectively}) \). Furthermore, within each transect significant levels of structure were detected for the study organisms (see Genetic Divisions section below). Only the inland transect for garter snakes lacked any detectable levels of population structure using this method.

No significant difference was found when \( \theta_{st} \) values for transects were compared with each other (e.g. the inland transect vs. the southern coast transect), implying that genetic differentiation within the transects was similar. However, the average pairwise \( \theta_{st} \) estimates implied that genetic differentiation between populations along the southern coast was highest on average for newts and lowest on average for garter snakes. In contrast, genetic differentiation between populations along the inland transect was highest on average for garter snakes and lowest on average for newts.

Several findings suggest that \( Ta. \) granulosa is a more limited disperser than \( Th. \) sirtalis. The scale of IBD for newts was half that for garter snakes (200 km vs. 400 km). Neighbourhood size \( (4D\pi\sigma^2) \), an estimate of the effective population size and migration, was found to be 65.4 individuals for garter snakes and 47.5 individuals for newts. Newts had higher allelic richness scores than garter snakes as well. The fact that newts exhibit more population structure than garter snakes is not surprising, given their smaller size, restrictive habitat requirements, and the generally poor dispersal capabilities of amphibians (Rothermel & Semlitsch, 2002).

Estimating gene flow indirectly (i.e. estimation via population structure as done here) can be potentially misleading for many reasons (Whitlock & McCauley, 1999). Nonetheless, Bayesian assignment analysis corroborated the interpretation that contemporary migration rates are high. Other methods of estimating gene flow based on coalescence theory might yield lower estimates than the frequency-based approaches used here. In a study of Lake Erie \( Th. \) sirtalis using the same number of microsatellite loci (and two of the same loci) as used here, Bittner & King (2003) found that the number of migrants per generation estimated using coalescent techniques was typically around one, while \( F_{st} \) approaches yielded estimates of greater than four. However, the same study also found that the net immigration rate from all other populations calculated using coalescent techniques was approximately the migration rate estimated using \( F_{st} \).

**Isolation by distance**

\( Thamnophis \) sirtalis and \( Ta. \) granulosa populations each showed patterns of IBD at relatively large scales (400 and 200 km, respectively). Demonstration of IBD is important because this...
potentially demonstrates a stepping-stone model of migration. Knowing that garter snakes and newts fit this underlying model implies that co-evolution may occur in the manner described by the geographic mosaic theory of co-evolution. Furthermore, the calculation of dispersal distances and neighbourhood sizes are appropriate for species that exhibit IBD, but not appropriate for populations that fit other models (e.g. the island model; Wright, 1931). The fact that garter snake and newt populations are more isolated as geographic distance increases is of particular importance to the independent evolution of populations (by allowing for the formation of phenotypic mosaics via geographically variable selection).

King & Lawson (2001) also found no IBD in the fine-scale genetic subdivision of Lake Erie Th. sirtalis within a transect. Lake Erie garter snake populations were sampled at a similar scale to our sample populations (pairwise population distances of 1–100 km). As for Th. sirtalis in the Pacific Northwest, Lake Erie garter snakes recolonized that region after the Pleistocene glaciation, so the findings of this study parallel those of King & Lawson (2001). This lack of IBD for both garter snakes and newts at distances of less than 400 km/200 km indicates that, for populations within our experimental transects, (co-)evolution is probably not occurring independently. The northern newt transect may be distinct in this regard from our other transects because of IBD within that particular transect. If selection mosaics exist within the transects as we would expect based on our transect locations (Brodie et al., 2002), then, as predicted by the geographic mosaic theory, we expect maladaptation to be present because of differential gene flow in these co-evolving species.

There could be multiple explanations for a lack of IBD at fine-scale distances. If populations are extremely subdivided at the scale of observation, then \( \theta_u \) should be large and relatively invariant, resulting in no covariance between distance and genetic relatedness. Conversely, if there is a lack of subdivision at the scale of observation, then \( \theta_u \) should be small and relatively invariant, again resulting in no covariance between distance and genetic relatedness. Non-equilibrium conditions also affect observed patterns of IBD (Slatkin, 1993), and could potentially lead to a lack of IBD. Another possibility is that landscape features (ridges, river drainage, rainfall, etc.) may lead to differential migration, and straight-line distance may not be the most appropriate measure of distance (Funk et al., 2005; Guillot et al., 2005). However, the general lack of variation in \( \theta_u \) within our transects makes it unlikely that landscape features would play a role in the lack of IBD (i.e. no or little covariance should exist, regardless of the distance measure). Within the sampling transects and across fine-scale distances, it seems as if either non-equilibrium conditions or high levels of ongoing gene flow are the most likely explanations for the lack of IBD, given the nature of our data.

Genetic divisions

The gross patterns of population differentiation in Ta. granulosa and Th. sirtalis seem consistent with a shared historical biogeography. Populations exhibited a high degree of genetic relatedness for both species, probably reflecting the recent glaciation of the region c. 14,000 yr BP (Thackray et al., 2004) in conjunction with ongoing gene flow. Studies across a broad range of taxa support the impact of glaciation on the biogeography of the Pacific Northwest. Hypothesized range expansions after the glacial recession have led to low levels of genetic variation in the region (Brown et al., 1997; Althoff & Thompson, 2001; Edmands, 2001). The fact that neighbourhood size estimates were small and consistent with those of other species that have low vagility (such as kangaroo rats and sedentary lycaenid butterflies; Waser & Elliott, 1991; Peterson, 1996; Roux et al., 2000) reinforces that the observed relatedness among populations is at least in part the result of recent recolonization of the region and not entirely the result of contemporary gene flow. Furthermore, some populations show relatively low \( \theta_u \) values but are not well connected by contemporary migration (e.g. Orick and Lost Lake). The combination of all these studies suggests that garter snake and newt population structure as well as their co-evolution have been shaped by climatological shifts occurring in the past 14,000 years in western North America.

For Ta. granulosa, there is a clear break in the northern transect in terms of population structure. The northern populations of Clallam Bay, Hoh River, and Cook Creek are genetically differentiated from the southern populations on this transect (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.029, P = 0.023 \)). Bayesian assignment identified Clallam Bay and Hoh river as a single population that acts as a source of migrants for populations further south in Washington (Table 2). In addition, the presence of a north-south break at approximately the Siskiyou Mountains can be seen in our amova analysis (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.037, P = 0.002 \)) and the pairwise comparisons of Orick with other populations along the southern coast. Orick is clearly distinct and currently isolated from the rest of the populations studied, as expected based on previous phyleogeographic analyses (Kuchta & Tan, 2005). The inland transect showed significant east–west genetic division between the Stayton and Adair populations (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.010, P = 0.001 \)). Lost Lake in central Oregon looks to be a source of migrants to the inland transect and is genetically distinct from the surrounding populations (Table 2); directional gene flow out of Lost Lake could be facilitated by the altitudinal gradient from the Cascade mountains to the coast (Funk et al., 2005).

The results for population structure in Th. sirtalis are consistent with the phyleogeography of Janzen et al. (2002) and similar to those observed in Ta. granulosa. As was evident in newts, snake populations in northern and southern Washington exhibit a genetic divide (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.014, P = 0.012 \)). However, for garter snakes the southern extent of the northern group seems to reach to Hoquiam (i.e. slightly further south than for newts). Cook Creek and the Chinook/Potter Slough populations acted as migrant sources for the northern and southern Washington groups, respectively (Table 2). The California populations of Orick and Crescent City formed a distinct genetic group (\( \phi_{CT} = 0.008, P = 0.024 \)) from the rest
of the populations along the transect, supporting the hypothesis of the north-south biogeographical split at approximately the California/Oregon border. Furthermore, Orick and Crescent City seem to be relatively isolated from ongoing migration (Table 2). Similarly to the case for *Ta. granulosa*, garter snakes from the Cascades population of Lost Lake are isolated and act as a source of migrants. The fact that Lost Lake garter snakes are isolated may be evidence of the hypothesized intermountain *Th. sirtalis* clade (Janzen et al., 2002); however, no evidence of significant genetic division was found along this transect (i.e. no significant $\varphi_{CT}$).

**Implications for co-evolution**

The process of co-evolution between garter snakes and newts must be occurring at a very quick pace (far outpacing mutation at neutral molecular sites), given the large phenotypic differences observed between some populations (Hanifin et al., 1999; Brodie et al., 2002). The apparent lack of genetic differentiation, owing to historical and contemporary gene flow, certainly presents the opportunity for maladaptation within the system, particularly if there is a geographic mosaic of selection pressures occurring on a finer scale than genetic subdivision. Those populations in which asymmetries in species’ migration rates are the greatest should be the most susceptible to maladaptation (Fig. 2).

It is difficult to tell whether immigrant counts (as estimated by BayesAss) or neighbourhood sizes are more relevant to the study of local adaptation. Two different paradigms of local adaptation are the ‘local vs. foreign’ concept and the ‘home vs. away’ concept (Kawecki & Ebert, 2004). When considering the ‘local vs. foreign’ framework, the number of immigrants (foreign individuals) would seem more important. Alternatively, under the ‘home vs. away’ framework, the transfer of individuals away from the home environment (neighbourhood size) is the unit of currency. Interestingly, these two frameworks yield mathematically identical local adaptation scores, despite the difference in underlying concepts; thus it is unclear which population structure metric should be used.

The scale at which garter snakes disperse seems to be considerably larger than that of newts (see above). In general, we expect stronger selection pressure on a prey item than on its generalist predator (life-dinner principle; Dawkins & Krebs, 1979), which could discourage gene flow among prey populations. The observed asymmetry in garter snake and newt population structure should favour local adaptation in *Ta. granulosa*, which is concordant with this expectation. However, as previously mentioned, some of the difference in dispersal capabilities is probably the result of physical constraints.

Two key differences are apparent in garter snakes and newts from the southern coast transect. First, there is a disparity in the location of the genetic subdivision (the division occurs farther south for newts). Second, we observed the strongest differences in population structure in the southern coast transect, where newts show the greatest amount of genetic differentiation ($\theta_s = 0.025$; average $\theta_s$ significantly different from other transects). In contrast, garter snakes show the least amount of genetic subdivision on this transect ($\theta_s = 0.017$; average $\theta_s$ significantly different from other transects). From these results, we predict that newts are locally adapted along the southwest coast of Oregon, and garter snakes are not.

The inland transect exhibits the opposite pattern to the southern coast: garter snake populations are most genetically differentiated in this region ($\theta_s = 0.032$), and newts show the least genetic differentiation there ($\theta_s = 0.009$). Initially, we might expect *Th. sirtalis* to be more locally adapted than newts and to provide the impetus behind co-evolution along this transect. However, based upon our AMOVA results, the lack of any significant population structure in this region for garter snakes – whilst significant structure was detected in newts – might require us to reconsider this expectation.

The northern coast transect showed an intermediate level of genetic differentiation for both species, which may indicate that both species have the opportunity to adapt locally along this cline. It is also possible that interactions in this area may pre-date interactions in the rest of the study area if post-glacial recolonization occurred from a northern refugium, further favouring local adaptation in this region. However, at the population level several mismatches in contemporary migration rates (Fig. 2), the presence of IBD in newts, and the disparity in the location of genetic division (further north for *Ta. granulosa*) may lead to maladaptation. Further analysis of the phenotypic structure of *Th. sirtalis* and *Ta. granulosa* in the Pacific Northwest is necessary to assess the impact of population structure on the co-evolutionary process.

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

We thank W. Leonard, P. Engelmeier, E. Lehman, and S. Trask for assistance with the collection of animals. We thank A. Jones, J. Chuckolovcak, and N. Combs for helping with fragment analysis. Comments provided by anonymous referees greatly improved this work. The research was approved by the Bloomington Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee (BIACUC protocol no. 03-058) and the Utah State University Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee (IACUC protocol no. 712). This study was supported by the National Science Foundation under grant no. DEB-99004070 to E.D.B., Jr, grant no. DEB-9903829 to E.D.B. III, and grant no. DEB-0104995 to B.J.R. (DDIG) and E.D.B. III, and by a National Science Foundation IGERT fellowship to B.J.R.

**REFERENCES**


**SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL**

The following supplementary material is available for this article:

**Appendix S1.** PCR conditions, distances, θₐ, and locales.

This material is available as part of the online article from http://www.blackwell-synergy.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1365-2699.2006.01642.x (This link will take you to the article abstract).

Please note: Blackwell Publishing are not responsible for the content or functionality of any supplementary materials supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing material) should be directed to the corresponding author for the article.

---

**BIOSKETCHES**

**Benjamin Ridenhour** is a post-doctoral researcher at the University of Idaho. He is primarily interested in how multiple species interact and co-evolve over broad geographic ranges. He is particularly interested in how microevolutionary forces, such as gene flow, shape antagonistic interspecific interactions.

**Edmund Brodie Jr** is a Professor of Biology at Utah State University. His primary research interests centre on the evolution and efficacy of amphibian antipredator mechanisms. These include: toxins, coloration, tail autotomy, morphology, behaviour. He is especially interested in individual differences and how they affect survival.

**Edmund Brodie III** is a Professor of Biology at the University of Virginia. He is interested in how selective forces shape biodiversity and how genetic processes translate natural selection into evolutionary changes. He is especially interested in how interactions among genes, traits, individuals and species influence the process of evolutionary change.

Editor: Brett Riddle